Illuminating the Sacred as Tangible: Catherine’s Private and Multi-Sensory Access to the Divine in the Hours of Catherine of Cleves

Amanda Hawkins

Skidmore College

Follow this and additional works at: https://creativematter.skidmore.edu/art_history_stu_schol

Recommended Citation

Hawkins, Amanda, "Illuminating the Sacred as Tangible: Catherine's Private and Multi-Sensory Access to the Divine in the Hours of Catherine of Cleves" (2012). Art History Honors Projects. 3.
https://creativematter.skidmore.edu/art_history_stu_schol/3

This Restricted Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Art History at Creative Matter. It has been accepted for inclusion in Art History Honors Projects by an authorized administrator of Creative Matter. For more information, please contact jluo@skidmore.edu.
Illuminating the Sacred as Tangible:

Catherine’s Private and Multi-Sensory Access to the Divine in the *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*

Amanda Hawkins

Honors Thesis

Spring 2012
INTRODUCTION

Illuminated manuscripts are some of the most significant cultural artifacts from the late Middle Ages and Renaissance. Between the mid-thirteenth and mid-sixteenth centuries, more books of hours were produced than any other type of book, including the Bible.\(^1\) Derived from official service books of the Church, books of hours from this time were personal prayer books under no control by the clergy; therefore, aspects of the content, decoration, and elaboration depended much on the patron.\(^2\) Although variations occurred, the general concepts and content of these books remained the same. By the late fourteenth century, the typical book of hours consisted of a Calendar, Gospel Lessons, Hours of the Virgin, Hours of the Cross, Hours of the Holy Spirit, the two prayers to the Virgin called the “Obsecro te” and the “O intermerata,” the Penitential Psalms and Litany, the Office of the Dead, and a group of about a dozen Suffrages.\(^3\) The Pierpont Morgan Library owns more than 370 hand-produced and printed books of hours, including the highly revered Dutch illuminated manuscripts, the *Hours of Catherine of Cleves* (Morgan Library, NY). This particular book of hours was produced around 1440 for Catherine, Duchess of Guelders, and contains 350 folios and 157 illustrations, presently divided into two volumes.\(^4\) Illustrated by the anonymous artist known as the Master of Cleves, the manuscript includes multiple accessory texts,

---

4. What was once thought of as the complete *Hours of Catherine of Cleves* once belonged in the library of the dukes of Arenberg. When New York dealer H.P. Kraus bought the manuscript from the then duke of Arenberg in 1957, he sold it to Alastair Bradley Martin’s Guennol Collection. In 1963, the Morgan Library bought another volume, also claiming to be the *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*. Shortly after, John Plummer, the Morgan’s curator of medieval and Renaissance manuscripts, determined that they belonged together and were once two halves of the original volume. For more information, see Roger S. Wieck, *The Hours of Catherine of Cleves: Devotion, Demons and Daily Life in the Fifteenth Century*, 14.
and the extensive nature of the illuminations reveal the wealthy status of its owner. The accessory prayers, which address religious concerns not covered elsewhere in the manuscript, reflect the interests and concerns of the patron, artist, and often a spiritual advisor. Many scholars revel in the book’s range of colors, minute details, inventive decoration, and unusual narrative cycles. James Marrow differs in his discussion by writing on the personal and spiritual relationship the book created between the duchess and the sacred realm. With this relationship in mind, my examination focuses on the tactile and multi-sensory experience created for Catherine that ultimately demonstrates how the personalization of her manuscript could provide her with spiritual freedom within the privacy of her own home—something necessary during an unstable marriage and political battle with her husband beginning in the 1430s. Investigating aspects of the accessory texts and the manuscript’s innovative iconography reveals how the manuscript, which allows the viewer to imaginatively touch, taste, smell, and hear the illustrations, could create a unique and personal religious experience for Catherine.

The use of one’s body to achieve a spiritual connection with the sacred was more typical of women than of men in Catherine’s time, and both religious authorities and spiritual directors

5 In addition to the Calendar and the Suffrages, the book contains a series of Hours and Votive Masses for each of the seven day of the week. Sunday is addressed to the Trinity, Monday to the Dead, Tuesday to the Holy Spirit, Wednesday to All Saints, Thursday to the Holy Sacrament, Friday to the Cross, and Saturday to the Virgin Mary.

6 For more information on James Marrow’s argument, see “Multitudo et Varietas: the Hours of Catherine of Cleves,” in The Hours of Catherine of Cleves: Devotion, Demons and Daily Life in the Fifteenth Century, 19-31. Info about this political battle. (cite DDD catalogue).

7 Bert Thissen, “Catherine of Cleves (1417-1476), Duchess of Guelders and Countess of Zutphen. A Biographical Sketch,” in The Hours of Catherine of Cleves: Devotion, Demons and Daily Life in the Fifteenth Century, 100-25. Catherine and Arnold’s marriage began to disintegrate in 1430 with conflict over Catherine’s dower rights and the financial stability of the family. Catherine was also caught in a conflict of loyalty between her family, whose prestige depended upon Philip the Good, and her husband. The political war between husband and wife deepened when Arnold disinherited his son, Adolf. Siding with her son ultimately caused anarchy, as the cities of Nijmegen, Zutphen, and Arnhem supported the duchess and her son, which Roermond sided with the duke. In 1465 Catherine and Arnold imprisoned Arnold and forced him to abdicate his throne.
considered the devout as psychosomatic beings and the body as a means of accessing the divine.\(^8\) Bodily events, such as weeping during prayer, were viewed as expressions of one’s inner soul, and the effect of viewing a work of art during a moment of intense meditation was recognized as extremely physical.\(^9\) In light of the physical aspect of women’s spirituality, illustrations that target Catherine’s physical and sensory responses - the smells, tastes, sounds, or physical touch of objects and figures within her manuscript – could serve as aids to her meditation.

The unification of vision and other physical senses was an area of inquiry long before Catherine’s manuscript was produced. In the fourteenth century Roger Bacon, an English philosopher and Franciscan friar, emphasized the physical interaction between objects and the senses. Bacon associated sight with sensations of pain and pleasure, arguing that the objects we view “move” us both physically and emotionally.\(^10\) That sight caused physiological changes recurs in medieval theology and folklore, and both Bacon and Aristotle considered seeing and feeling as innately connected; sight was a sensation, a physical “touch,” a feeling “expressed in matter.”\(^11\) These perceptions continued, causing Diderot and Descartes in the eighteenth century to study the


\(^9\) Cordelia Warr, “Re-reading the Relationship Between Devotional Images, Visions, and the Body: Clare of Montefalco and Margaret of Citta di Castello,” 226. Warr notes the specific example of Angela of Foligo, who was so affected by particular images that she became ill. According to Angela’s *Memorial*: “Whenever I saw the Passion of Christ depicted in art, I could not bear it; a fever would overtake me and I would become sick.” See C. Mazzoni, ed/s, and J Cirignano, trans., *Angela of Foligno’s “Memorial”* (Cambridge 1999) 32, and Warr, “Re-reading the Relationship,” 218.

\(^10\) Biernoff, 51. Also see Roger Bacon, *Opus Majus of Roger Bacon*, Tras R. Burke, 2 vols (New York: Russell, 1962), 2:445-6 (5.1.4.2). Bacon writes on the experience the eye feels from sight as if it were painful, stating that “For we observe that strong light and colour narrow vision and injure it, and inflict pain...Therefore vision always experiences a feeling that is a kind of pain.”

\(^11\) Biernoff, 53. For Bacon and Aristotle, images of the visible world reproduced in the eyes and brain are equivalent to material images. Quoted from Aristotle, *On the Soul*, 1.1.403a25, and Bacon, *Opus majus*, 2:425 (5.1.1.4) cited by Biernoff p. 53. See also Aristotle, *De Anima* (425b-425a) on his discussion of the coherence of the senses, termed *sensus communis* or “common sensibility.”
“visualization” of the blind, suggesting an underlying unification of the senses. Recent neuropsychological findings reinforce this view that the senses cannot be considered separate from one another. In 2003, neurologist Oliver Sacks wrote of the “increasing evidence from neuroscience for the extraordinary rich interconnectedness of interactions of the sensory areas of the brain” and of the “difficulty, therefore, of saying that anything is purely visual or purely auditory, or purely anything.” Considering this medieval understanding of the interconnectedness of the senses and the idea of sight as an extension of the flesh, Catherine’s manuscript takes on greater meaning. As these concepts were often specifically connected to art in the Middle Ages, the visual representations within Catherine’s manuscript that reference taste, touch, sound, and smell would likely have a strong effect on the viewer.

My first chapter investigates the relationship created between Catherine and the Virgin Mary through unique and tactile illuminations. The miniatures throughout the Monday Hours of the Virgin bridge the physical gap between the sacred and secular, elevating Catherine to an exclusive position. The recurring emphasis on the Virgin Mary’s breast provides a different kind of tangible relationship between Catherine and the Mother of God. By highlighting the Virgin’s physical female body and breast, the illustrations connect the two as physical women and mothers. In the second chapter, I examine the death ritual and funeral images throughout the Wednesday Hours of the Dead. Not only are these images didactic, they also draw upon Catherine’s senses and recall actual funeral practice. Furthermore, by visually illustrating Purgatory, the Master of Cleves creates a concrete vision of the afterlife that allowed Catherine a glimpse of her own fate and that of her


family, providing her with an understanding of how active devotion affects the bodies and souls of her loved ones. My third chapter focuses on the manuscript’s unique border illuminations and bas-de-page imagery located primarily within the Suffrages. The imaginative participation of Catherine’s body is by triggering sensations of touch, taste, and smell invoked through the representation of objects directly inspired by her surroundings and personal belongings. The incredibly detailed and realistic objects, as well as the illuminator’s use of tromp l’œil techniques, invite Catherine into the Saint’s space, and bring divine figures into her own.

The unique aspects of the Hours of Catherine of Cleves—the weekday accessory texts and innovative border designs—create a physical encounter for the viewer by stimulating different sensations. As Bernard Berenson suggested, the “tactile values” of works of art stimulate sensations of touch.14 The illuminations here, however, have the ability to stimulate each of Catherine’s senses. Looking and meditating upon these images invoked the viewer’s sense of touch, taste, hearing, smell, and vision, merging them into one coherent and powerful experience. Catherine’s involvement with her manuscript, as well as the deeply personal and physical experience created for her ultimately demonstrates how the individualization of books of hours provided women with a stronger spiritual initiative and freedom from within the privacy of their own homes.

---

14 As quoted in Juhani Pallasmaa, The Eyes of the Skin (England: John Wiley & Sons, 2005), 44.
CHAPTER 1

Catherine and the Virgin Mary: the Physical Nature of Motherhood and Femininity

At the heart of every book of hours lies the Hours of the Virgin, or the Little Office of Our Lady (Officium parvum beate Marie Virginis). Through the mystery of the Incarnation, Mary became a central figure in Christian devotion, taking on the role of the new Eve, a surrogate mother for the pious, and a vital intercessor with God.\textsuperscript{15} By the fourteenth century, the importance of the Virgin Mary—and particularly the Cult of the Virgin—grew significantly throughout the Christian world. Books of hours, like Catherine’s, provide evidence of Mary’s status and the layperson’s veneration towards her as the prime intercessor to God. The prayers within the Hours of the Virgin were recited, ideally, throughout the course of the entire day. As spiritual mother, Mary hears the petitions of the devout, and pleads their cases to her Son.\textsuperscript{16} How Catherine would have understood and interacted with her manuscripts can be revealed by visually analyzing the unique aspects of the Hours of Catherine of Cleves and examining late medieval religious practices and attitudes toward spirituality. Catherine’s manuscript contains the Saturday Mass of the Virgin, an accessory text for typical books of hours that usually only occurs in longer versions of such manuscripts. Therefore, the unique nature of Catherine’s Saturday Mass must be examined, as it is a section of the manuscript that is more personalized for the patron, displaying her individual desires for her private manuscript. In the Saturday Hours, Mary serves as a model of motherhood, humility, and devotion. By placing Catherine and Mary within related visual spheres and by emphasizing Mary’s corporeal body and breast within numerous illustrations, the Master of Cleves provided Catherine with

multiple ways of physically relating to the Virgin.

New practices focused on the physical and emotional aspects of devotion developed from the teachings of St. Francis in the later Middle Ages. The late thirteenth-century *Meditations on the Life of Christ*, written by a Franciscan follower, encouraged readers to connect with divine figures through understanding the feelings and emotions presented in each narrative. Gaining popularity from the fourteenth century onwards, this well-known text encouraged readers to emulate the sensations of these sacred figures and imagine events from their point of view through either the *imitatio Christi* or *imitatio Mariae*. A section from the *Meditations* reads: “[w]ith how much happiness…did she [St. Mary] embrace, kiss, [and] gently hug…her son! Oh, how often and how gently she looks at His face and all parts of His most holy body!” Contemplating narratives such as this allowed the faithful to envision an event through Mary’s perspective, ultimately unifying the sacred and earthly realms. In *The Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, the Master of Cleves worked to connect Catherine and Mary through their physical, female bodies and by the fundamental role they shared as mothers.

The Virgin Mary first appears on folio Iv, at the beginning of the Hours of the Virgin,

17 Gerladine A. Johnson, “Beautiful Brides and Model Mothers: The Devotional and Talismanic Functions of Early Modern Marian Reliefs,” in *The Material Culture of Sex, Procreation, and Marriage in Premodern Europe*, ed. A McClanand and K. Encarnacion (NY: Palgrave, 2002), 135-62. St. Francis was known for publically reenacting a Nativity scene in which the representation of Christ appeared as real during the Miracle at Greccio, as well as his own display of his stigmatized body.


19 I. Ragusa and R. B. Greens, eds., *Meditations on the Life of Christ: An Illustrated Manuscript of the Fourteenth Century* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1961), 55. Given the complex miniatures and sophisticated iconographical cycles, it appears that the scribe and the illuminator collaborated in each phase of production, or that they both worked in conjunction with someone who oversaw the entire manuscript, possibly a theological advisor. Plummer has proposed that a learned cleric or scholar may have assisted in the compilation of the text and contributed to the cycles of illustrations, but the identity of such an advisor remains unknown. See Plummer, *The Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, 13 and Robert G. Calkins, *Distribution of Labor: The Illuminators of the Hours of Catherine of Cleves and Their Workshop* (Philadelphia: The American Philosophical Society, 1979), 50-10 for further reading.
standing within a small chapel and holding her infant Son. This image of Catherine of Cleves
Kneeling before the Virgin and Child (Fig. 1) shows Catherine holding an open book—most likely
her personal manuscript—in prayer before the Mother and Child. Her identity is assured by the
coats of arms of Catherine and her ancestors placed within the marginal decorations. In front of
Catherine, a banderole reads, "O mater dei memento mei," or “O mother of God remember me.”
This speech scroll is a critical component of the image. As Catherine views herself actively
participating and speaking within the manuscript, she could have imagined the sounds of each word
in her head, or physically hear them spoken out loud during prayer. Meanwhile, within the heavenly
façade, Mary performs an assisting role in the response, as she holds the ink well in which Christ
dips his pen. Christ’s written response demonstrates that Mary has successfully performed her role
as Catherine’s intercessor.

Through the use of both spoken and written scrolls, a personal and
intimate relationship is created within this illumination, yet this relationship becomes even closer
when examining Catherine’s physical positioning on the page.

Although the physical space of Mary and Christ is made distinctly separate and heavenly
through the depiction of a chapel, angels, and a gold leaf background behind the holy figures,
Catherine’s figure crosses over into their divine realm. When considering James Marrow’s
discussion of the book of hours of the Duchess Margaret of Cleves, the extension of Catherine’s

20 James Marrow, “Multitudo et Varietas: the Hours of Catherine of Cleves,” in The Hours of Catherine of
21 Eberhard König, “Ms. M. 945, fol. 1v, Catherine of Cleves before the Virgin and Child, full-page
miniature for the Hours of the Blessed Virgin, Matins,” in The Hours of Catherine of Cleves: Devotion,
Demons, and Daily Life in the Fifteenth Century, ed. Rob Duckers and Ruud Priem (New York: The Morgan
Library Museum, 2009), 224. Eberhard König argued the written response is in German, as the two letters—
“ic,” perhaps for “ich,” or “I”—are visible, and Friedrich Gorissen suggested that the response reads “Ic [im
de uuech],” which translates to “I am the way. I myself cannot discern the letters “ic” for certain, and find
Gorissen’s suggestion questionable, as the manuscript is written in Latin, not German. See Friedrich
Gorissen, Das Stundenbuch der Katharina von Kleve; Analyse und Kommentar (Germany: Gebr. Mann
Verlag, 1973).
dress into the chapel scene with Mary and Christ becomes more significant. Marrow acknowledges Margaret’s positioning in the first miniature of the Hours of the Virgin, noting how her prominence and relation to the religious subjects is rare. He then discusses more traditional representations of donors in illuminated manuscripts prior to this one, highlighting how donors are typically portrayed in a smaller scale and in a space that is clearly distinct from the divine figures to which they pray. Although the Master of Cleves employs a hierarchical scale, showing Mary almost twice as large as the Duchess, Catherine is not placed within a completely distinct and separate space as the Mother and Child; her garment practically touches Mary’s own. Rather than assuming the role of an isolated and passive subject, Catherine attains a closer interaction with the subjects of her worship through overlapping their space and directly addressing the Virgin through her speech scroll. As the first full-page illumination Catherine would see within her manuscript, it serves to inspire contemplation, encourage prayer, and increase reverence for the Virgin Mary, yet it also sets the entire tone of the manuscript by bridging the gap between Catherine’s sphere and that of the divine.

The individualized Saturday Hours of the Virgin continue to support an intimate relationship between Catherine and Mary by emphasizing Mary’s role as a caretaker and a loving mother. Two particular images of the Holy Family highlight the relationship between mother and child and demonstrate how books of hours encapsulate the spirit of their time by incorporating real-life scenarios and objects. The Holy Family appears in two separate domestic settings within this section of the manuscript. The first, *Holy Family at Work* (Fig. 2), pictures the family in a simple and unadorned domestic interior. The hard-working and humble family labors within their home; Mary weaves at her loom and Joseph stands with his trimming ax, engaged in his carpentry. Rather

than presenting Christ as a demure religious figure, the Master of Cleves creates a more humanizing and lighthearted image of the child, who plays in his walker—much like Catherine’s own children.\textsuperscript{23} The location is a fifteenth century middle-class household, with a shelf of silver plates, a fireplace, and windows opening up to the earthly countryside. Although Catherine, the Duchess of Guelders, would not have resided in such a modest home, what is important here is the humanization of the Holy Family. By placing the Holy Family in a contemporary, domestic setting, the Master of Cleves transforms them from a Holy Family into a secular family partaking in domestic activity.

Mary’s role within this image could serve as particularly instructional for Catherine. Picturing Mary weaving with a spindle and thread references a legend from her childhood, in which she spins a new veil for the Ark of the Covenant.\textsuperscript{24} As a well-educated Duchess, Catherine might have known legends such as this, as well as those from the *Meditations on the Life of Christ*. These legends, which bring a new sense of reality to the divine figures, are complimented by Mary’s actions in the scene. Although Catherine would not have lived in a similar household and not likely partake in physical labor, it would have been important for Catherine to envision Mary in such a humanizing position, partaking in female domestic activity. The family pictured here is representative of the ideal domestic situation. Mary is shown as a humble, hardworking mother. Praise for the Virgin’s humility, one of her essential virtues, can be found in *The Meditations of the*...

\textsuperscript{23} Bert Thissen, “Catherine of Cleves (1417-1476), Duchess of Guelders and Countess of Zutphen, A Biographical Sketch,” in *The Hours of Catherine of Cleves: Devotions, Demons, and Daily Life in the Fifteenth Century*, 108. Catherine’s children were most likely born in the first ten years of her marriage. After her first miscarriage in 1431, Catherine gave birth to Mary, her first daughter, in 1433. Catherine and Arnold’s first son, William, was born in 1434, but died shortly after. Her second son, Edward, also suffered a young death. Margaret, the second daughter, was born in 1436, and their son Adolph was born in 1439. Catherine also had another daughter, but the details of her birth are unknown. After experiencing the death of two children (William and Edward) and raising three of her own, Catherine would have likely been able to connect to the physical and emotional relationship pictured between Mary and Christ in her prayerbook.

Life of Christ: “If you are not able to imitate the virginity of the humble one, follow the humility of the Virgin…I dare say that without humility the virginity of the holy Mary would not have pleased God.”\textsuperscript{25} Mary’s modest occupation in this image re-enforces this idea and creates a humble, human figure from a divine one. Lastly, this image emphasizes the vital relationship between a mother and her son. The banderole floating up towards Mary, held up by her Infant Son, reads in Latin, “I am your solace.”\textsuperscript{26} As Catherine had children of her own, she could similarly find comfort in her sons and daughters as Mary does in Christ.

A comparable intimate scene of the Holy Family occurs in the Holy Family at Supper (Fig. 3), which displays the personal and delicate relationship between the Mother and her Son. The Virgin sits upon the floor, nursing the infant Christ, as Joseph sits to the left of her eating his meal. The image shows an equally simple setting as in the previous domestic interior, with similar furnishings surrounding the tall fireplace.\textsuperscript{27} This image conflates the Madonna lactans with the Madonna of Humility, which shows the Virgin seated humbly on the ground with the Christ Child on her lap. Here, the emphasis is on the humanity and humility of the Virgin Mary as a mother. This intimate scene recalls another passage from the Meditations of the Life of Christ: “How readily she nursed Him, feeling a great and unknown sweetness in nursing this Child, such as could never be

\textsuperscript{25} Barbara G. Lane, “An Immaculist Cycle in the Hours of Catherine of Cleves,” Oud Holland 87, no. 4 (1973): 195-6. This passage Lane includes is from Ragusa, Meditations, Ch. XVI, 111f, and is based on St. Bernard, Super Missus est Homiliae, Homilia I.

\textsuperscript{26} Plummer, The Hours of Catherine of Cleves, catologue n. 92. The banderel reads in Latin: Ego sum solacium tuum.

\textsuperscript{27} Jos Koldeweij, “Objects depicted in the miniatures and margins of the Hours of Catherine of Cleves, in The Hours of Catherine of Cleves: Devotion, Demons, and Daily Life in the Fifteenth Century, ed. Rob Duckers and Ruud Priem (New York: The Morgan Library Museum, 2009), 138-9. Koldeweij notes that particular objects within the Holy Family at Supper miniature have been directly connected to the Cleves House. The fully furnished late medieval a three-legged cooking pot with a handle and lid. Identical pots have been excavated at the Cleves House in Haarlem, as well as the same type of scissors and pewter plates on the wall behind Mary. (DDD Catalogue, author JK, pp 138-9.)
felt by other women!” We can assume that Catherine would not have breastfed her own children, as most fifteenth-century middle-class families employed other women to nurse their children due to the social order at the time. This image of the Virgin nursing her child, however, need not be read as didactic for Catherine, as the viewer could still relate to Mary as a woman assuming the secular role of a nurturing mother. By emphasizing Mary’s role as a physical mother, the illustrations also reference her humanity and accessibility as an intercessor to Catherine.

The Virgin’s morally elevated, yet humanizing, humility also serves as a directly personal and instructional message for Catherine to live a humble and nurturing lifestyle. Catherine could have related to Mary’s on another level through her feminine body as well. Megan Holmes notes the standard conventions of depicting the Virgin’s breast, which include the breast being partially covered by a veil or drapery, displacement of the breast to the level of the woman’s collarbone, and depicting the breast as detached from her body, distorted in shape and size, such as the Virgin’s breast in Jean Fouquet’s *Melun Diptych* (Fig. 4). Although Mary’s breast in the *Holy Family at Supper* scene is somewhat distorted in shape, it is clearly attached to her body, nowhere near her collarbone, and is completely uncovered, just like a breast would be in the true nature of breastfeeding. This naturalistic depiction of Mary’s breast and physical body provides Catherine with a more human female figure with whom she can relate.

As the emphasis of these two illuminations is on motherhood, the images could have been useful to Catherine as models of family, instructing her how to behave on earth. Mary’s

30 Milk also symbolizes the full humanity of Jesus and as a metaphor for the gift of life, as the life of the child depends on it for his own life. See Warner, *Alone of All Her Sex: The Myth and the Cult of the Virgin Mary*, 192-99 for further reading. Can you think of a northern example? Perhaps the virgin from the Melun diptych? It is a little later, but a really awkward breast.
concentration on her activities and lack of visual contact with the viewer emphasizes her function as a role model rather than an intercessor. Cynthia Hahn argued that images of the Holy Family, like Robert Campin’s *Mérode Altarpiece* (Fig. 5), served as models of marriage and family. Hahn notes that Campin’s Mary and Joseph, although spiritual models, are also unified pair that demonstrates both the sacred and everyday characteristics of marriage. In Catherine’s Manuscript, the *Holy Family at Work* and the *Holy Family at Supper* serve similar roles as instructional depictions of marriage and family, as well as models for Christian life. In most late medieval portrayals of the Holy Family, Joseph plays a supporting role, often being placed in his own workspace that is physically separate from Mary and Christ. By placing the three figures together in intimate settings, the Master of Catherine of Cleves providing a family model for Catherine after her marriage to Arnold of Egmond. These images represent the Holy family as figures of an “Earthly Trinity,” by embodying the ideals of key family roles. Mary has an aural and physical relationship to her Son with whom she visibly speaks with, looks at, and caresses. Catherine was a wife and mother herself, and the intimacy of these family scenes engages her senses associated with motherhood and allows reflection upon her own religious experience. Although Catherine and Arnold developed hostile feelings for each other shortly into their marriage, Catherine could find solace within these images when considering Mary’s relationship to her Son. Although they are pictured as a family, Joseph remains a separate entity in both images, and Mary maintains a verbal

32 Hahn, “Joseph Will Perfect,” 61, 63.
33 Hahn, “Joseph Will Perfect.” 56.
34 Hahn, “Joseph Will Perfect,” 55. In late medieval Europe, new conceptions of family roles arose, as represented through art. Joseph’s previous role as old and ineffective is replaced by the role of a hard-working provider, reflecting the ideas of work and family during the fifteenth century.
35 Joseph’s disinterested demeanor and distance from the couple does not disturb the fact that Catherine could still call upon the Virgin as a model of a good mother. Catherine may have also found solace in the buffoon-like representation of Joseph at supper, as she was not even living with her husband by 1440.
and physical relationship with Christ alone.

One of the last images in the Saturday Hours, *The Virgin and the Crucified Christ Intercede for Catherine of Cleves* (Fig. 6), again emphasizes Mary’s motherly role and invites Catherine into the sacred realm. In this particular miniature, Catherine kneels to the cross’s left, carrying her rosary and beseeching the Virgin Mary to pray for her.\(^{36}\) The intercessions continue, as Mary bears her breast and asks for Christ to be gracious to Catherine for Mary’s sake, and Christ then asks God the Father to spare Catherine.\(^{37}\) In comparison to the interaction between Catherine and the divine in *Catherine of Cleves Kneeling before the Virgin and Child*, a more direct connection is established here as she is now fully encompassed within the same spatial realm as Mary, Christ, and God the Father. Even more significant is the change in Catherine’s scale. Not only has the hierarchy been eliminated, but Catherine kneels on the same physical level as Mary herself, Mary upon a cloth of red and Catherine upon a cloth of blue. Furthermore, Catherine now receives a direct response and action from Mary who intercedes on behalf of Catherine by emphasizing to her son that she nourished him with her milk (*Propter ubera que te lactaverunt sis sibi propicius*).\(^{38}\) Christ then appeals to God the Father who responds, “Fili, exaudita est oracio tuua,” or “your prayer has been

---

\(^{36}\) Barbara G. Lane, “The Symbolic Crucifixion in the Hours of Catherine of Cleves.” *Oud Holland* 87, no. 1 (1973): 4. Lane states that the idea of combined intercessions comes from medieval theological treatises, and is ultimately related to the theme of the Virgin’s compassion. In this illustration, the Virgin Mary kneels at the left of the cross, exposing her breast. Her scroll reads, “On account of the breasts which suckled You, may You be gracious unto her.” Mary’s breast in relation to Catherine will soon be discussed in more depth.


\(^{38}\) Eberhard König, “Ms. M. 917, p. 160, *The Virgin as Intercessor and Catherine of Cleves under the Cross*” in *The Hours of Catherine of Cleves: Devotion, Demons and Daily Life in the Fifteenth Century*, 348. The inscriptions on each scroll are as follows: Catherine appeals to the Virgin, pleading, ‘Pray for me, holy mother of God.’ Mary then intercedes with Christ, explaining her bare breast: ‘On account of the breasts which suckled You, may You be gracious unto her.’ Christ then speaks to the Lord, saying ‘Father, on account of my wounds pardon her,’ and God replies, ‘Son, your request is heard.’ Transcriptions of the Latin text may be found in F. Gorissen, ‘Das Stundenbuch der Katharina van kleve, ein Beitrag zu seiner Datierung’, *Bulletin van de Koninklijke Nederlandsche Oudheidkundige Bond*, LXIV, 1965, 6, and Pieper, ‘Stundebuch,’ 141.
heard with favor.\textsuperscript{39} Through these multiple intercessions, the illustrations visually assure Catherine’s salvation.

Although Catherine is connected to each figure within the Crucifixion miniature, her most important interaction is with the Virgin Mary, who squeezes the milk from her breast as a way to emphasize her power and motherly relationship to Christ.\textsuperscript{40} The \textit{Madonna Lactans} image—or images in which Mary bears her breast—is often used to express the Virgin’s humanity. The Virgin Mary is not a typical mother, as she is exempt from intercourse, yet by picturing her suckling her child or highlighting her ability to lactate, the Master of Cleves has given Catherine a reason to feel connected to Mary as a physical woman. Images in which Mary bears her breast, such as the Crucifixion image in Catherine’s book of hours, are seen as particularly effective intercessory images because they illustrate something deeper than a simple maternal relationship; they indicate Mary’s active physical connection with Christ and the physical nature of her motherhood.\textsuperscript{41} Often associated with powers of healing and intercession, the Virgin’s milk was also associated with many relics in Europe beginning in the thirteenth century.\textsuperscript{42} Not only would the continued emphasis on the Virgin’s breast and breast milk throughout the Saturday Mass of the Virgin in Catherine’s manuscript inspire both veneration and contemplation, but they emphasize a humble, human Madonna; a woman that Catherine could both physically connect to and also strive to be like.

\textsuperscript{39} Plummer, \textit{The Hours of Catherine of Cleves}, 96.  
\textsuperscript{40} The Virgin Mary also bears her breast in the \textit{Last Judgment} miniature in the Mass of the Dead, which will be discussed in more detail later. By repeating this motif, the Master of Cleves reinforces the Virgin’s physical connection between Mary and Christ, and more generally, between a mother and her child.  
\textsuperscript{41} Beth Williamson, “The Cloisters Double Intercession; The Virgin as Co-Redemptrix.” \textit{Apollo} 152 (2000): 49. Not only does these images emphasize Mary’s human characteristics, but they also highlight the full humanity of Jesus who relied on this milk from his mother to survive. For further reading see “The Milk of Paradise” in Maria Warner, \textit{Alone of All Her Sex: the Myth and the Cult of the Virgin Mary} (New York: Vintage Books, 1983), 192.  
\textsuperscript{42} Warner, \textit{Alone in All Her Sex}, 200. Reliquaries that apparently preserved Mary’s milk attracted pilgrims in extremely large numbers and were highly venerated in Europe at this time. These relics were said to hold the Virgin’s milk itself, “transcendental” milk that appeared from heaven, or even a piece of the ground at Bethlehem that were in contact with drops of milk from when Mary was nursing.
The book’s presence suggests the entire scene as a vision experienced during prayer, calling upon Catherine’s own imagination while highlighting its significance in Catherine’s prayer. In the scene, the manuscript lies open atop a small stool pictured beneath the cross. Her vision becomes analogous to touch as she is guided by the Saint’s hand into the shared space. The presence of the book is also instructional for Catherine, visually illustrating for her that through prayers and devotion, the separation between the secular and the sacred worlds will cease to exist. By illustrating both Catherine and her prayer book as entering the physical space of the spiritual world, the Master of Cleves demonstrates the cause and effect of earthly prayer. The miniatures picture a growing and progressive relationship between Catherine and Mary, visually ensuring Catherine’s salvation through piety. By witnessing this tangible relationship with Mary, Christ, God the Father, and the Saint who physically touches her shoulder while presenting her, Catherine could gain religious security as she studied the illustrations. She could imaginatively feel the touch of the Saint’s hand on her back, hear the individual voices as her prayers are answered, and envision sharing the physical sacred space with the Virgin Mary.

This close examination of Catherine’s physical and intimate relationship with the Virgin Mary throughout her manuscript reveals how the Master of Cleves dissolves the boundaries between the secular and the sacred, merging them into one unbroken and familiar sphere for the viewer. This unique section of Catherine’s manuscript first humbles Mary by bringing her into the earthly realm, surrounded by secular objects and involved in very human behaviors and activities in the scenes of the Holy Family. Then, by emphasizing Mary’s breast and physical relationship to Christ, the Master of Cleves emphasizes her body as a woman and mother, something Catherine

---

43 König, “Ms. M. 917, p. 160, The Virgin as Intercessor and Catherine of Cleves under the Cross,” 348. König states that the prayer book “betrays that the entire scene, which is set on a tiled floor against a golden ground, was only the imagination during prayer.”
could physically relate to while praying in the privacy of her own home. Finally by inviting Catherine into the Crucifixion scene in the Saturday Hours, the Master of Cleves secures this corporeal relationship between Catherine and the holy figures of her worship, demonstrating the unique capabilities of personalized books of hours.

CHAPTER 2

The Tangibility of Death and the Afterlife

In addition to the standard Office of the Dead, The Hours of Catherine of Cleves includes another extensive and detailed accessory text related to death—the Monday Hours of the Dead. Through detailed and realistic imagery, the Monday Hours provided an inherent interactivity that would remind Catherine of the connections between her own faith and the souls of her friends and relatives in the fires of purgatory. It is once again within this accessory text where the commissioner’s particular interests are revealed. The eight illustrations in the Monday Hours present Catherine with visual models for contemporary funeral practice and show her scenes of souls in Purgatory.44 Due to their diminutive scale, however, the illustrations require the owner to carefully inspect and contemplate each image. As memento mori images that served to remind people of their mortality gained significance in the late fourteenth and early fifteenth centuries after the bubonic plague, seeing and hearing about death was customary.45 Christians, however, still relied on repetition to train their memories and remember facts concerning death. By revisiting the same facts and ideas through repetitive prayer—such as the Hail Mary and Our Father—as well as

44 The miniatures in the Monday Hours are ordered: Deathbed, Souls Tormented in Purgatory, Preparation of the Corpse, Chanting the Office of the Dead, Burial, Offering at a Requiem Mass, Souls in Purgatory Consoled with the Offering, Souls Released from Purgatory.
re-reading of books of hours, as in Catherine’s case, the pious could imagine and come to terms with death. The images within the Monday Hours presented a visible reminder of mortality, and by physically turning the pages to reveal the future prospect of death, each viewing became an intimate act of remembering her own fate and that of her loved ones.

These accessory illuminations, depicting various realistic phases of death, dying, and contemporary funeral practices are not only didactic, but further establish a physical connection between Catherine and the images within her manuscript by emphasizing the body. The first image within the Monday Hours is the Matins Deathbed Scene (Fig. 7), the only full-page miniature in this section. As Catherine Yvard explains, the highest point of a virtuous, Christian life is a perfect death, which became particularly vital in Catherine’s day. A heightened sense of mortality characterized the later Middle Ages, as the Black Death spread throughout Western Europe from 1347-1350, killing one third of the European population. Several diseases, such as syphilis and new strains of influenza, additionally ravaged Europe, causing sudden and gruesome deaths. As these diseases continued to spread and plague recurred throughout Europe for at least three centuries, health concerns sparked strong psychological reactions and an intensified concern with death and dying. Sudden and unexpected death became an increasing worry in European society, and dying “well” became imperative. In the early fifteenth century, specific treatises on dying emerged, including the Ars moriendi, or art of dying, accompanied by a shift from the idea of collective judgment at the end of time to the concept of individual judgment at the hour of one’s death. These changes intensified the concern for one’s personal moment of judgment and the preparation for a

“good” death.49

The Deathbed scene presents Catherine with aspects of an ideal death and encourages her to act based upon what she is shown as the “right” and “wrong” way to behave among dying family members and loved ones. An ideal death took place in a bedroom, crowded with people who surround the dying man or woman. A priest would be called to give the dying a Last Communion, and family and friends would fill the room with prayers.50 In contemporary illustrations of deathbed scenes, the dying often found themselves surrounded by demons, angels, saints, the Virgin, Christ, or the Trinity, highlighting that in this dangerous hour, man faced his greatest temptations against sin.51 No devil or sign of temptation is present in the Deathbed Scene in the Hours of Catherine of Cleves; the illustration represents aspects of an ideal death. In this miniature, a dying man is pictured laying in bed, surrounded by a woman praying over a book, other figures tending to the man, a physician examining urine, two gentlemen, and a figure, possibly a priest or Carmelite monk, seated at the table.52 This death is expected, and its planned nature provides a consoling image of a good death for the viewer, as well as instructional warnings dealing with how not to behave at a loved one’s death. Without the presence of Mary, Christ, or any other holy to provide a sense of security for the dying, and perhaps even for Catherine herself, the Master of Cleves presents a wholly secular and realistic scene of death. The artist also incorporates a number of

50 Catherine Yvard, “Death Illuminated,” 118. The high presence of family, friends, and even neighbors, display just how crucial this moment was, and how death was viewed as a public event in the Middle Ages.
52 Plummer, The Hours of Catherine of Cleves, catalogue n. 41. The table holds numerous vessels and other objects that Plummer presumes to be used in the Viaticum or Extreme Unction. The two men toward the door are identified by Plummer as a companion, and the other as a mercenary heir. König suggests that the figure sitting in the deathbed scene is a Carmelite monk (see König, “Ms. M. 917, p. 180, “Deathbed scene,” in The Hours of Catherine of Cleves: Devotion, Demons and Daily Life in the Fifteenth Century, 274.
sensory references for the viewer to imaginatively experience upon viewing. Catherine could imagine sensing the gentle touch of the woman’s fingers upon the dying man’s forehead; breathing in the scents of the numerous vessels resting upon the table; observing the urine sample as the physician does in the background; and hearing the words emanating from the woman’s mouth as she clasps her hands in prayer. As meditating on the Offices of the Dead and keeping the thought of death in mind was considered the best way to prepare for death, the illustrations that heighten Catherine’s physical and sensory relationship would contribute to this aim.53

The illumination further offers a supplementary didactic model for Catherine as a warning against greed. The young man standing by the doorway in blue seems to pay his respects to the dying man, yet his true nature is revealed in the bas-de-page, where he rummages through a chest, inspecting the money bags that will be left to him. In contrast to this character, the Master of Cleves has pictured an older woman, seated low towards the ground, praying. Her pose resembles the Madonna of Humility and classifies her as humble and pious. As the only figure that faces out towards the viewer, Catherine had the opportunity to make a closer connection with this woman who directly confronts her gaze. The pious woman, like the Virgin Mary, could serve as a model for Catherine’s behavior, instructing her in the importance of devoutness surrounding death. Through her meditations, Catherine would have become well versed in both the necessities for an ideal death and the proper way to treat the dead.

Immediately following the Deathbed scene, the second image in the Monday Hours pictures the tortured Souls Tormented in Purgatory (Fig. 8). From early on, penitential prayers of repentant sinners were considered powerful and were believed to assist salvation of the deceased while in Purgatory. The Second Council of Lyons in 1274, however, resulted in the further clarification of

53 Yvard, “Death Illuminated,” 118.
the doctrine of Purgatory, ultimately encouraging an increased and frequent amount of prayer on behalf of the dead.⁵⁴ As the fascination with the literary and visual imagery of hell and damnation in the Middle Ages grew, the notions of punishment were greatly enriched, as was the idea of Purgatory. An imprecise location in space and time, Purgatory soon acquired a tangible representation, often associated with the physical aspect of fire. Purgatory was considered a matter of punishment rather than Penance, and each soul spent time in Purgatory that varied depending on the gravity of their sins and the eagerness of the living to offer help to the deceased. After the second half of the twelfth century, Purgatorial time became increasingly more concrete, measurable, and varied among individuals.⁵⁵ The importance of being a worthy heir and praying for her loved ones is heightened for Catherine by the image of burning souls in Purgatory immediately following the pious woman praying for the deceased man on the facing folio.

Although the performance of prayers by the living was considered the most effective means for lessening purgatorial time, indulgence could also be earned prior to one’s death in the form of good works. This way, the living could be granted indulgences for specific deeds and prayers on earth as a way to lessen their own time and that of their loved ones in Purgatory.⁵⁶ The Tuesday Hours of the Holy Ghost provides a didactic model of this practice for Catherine. The illustration for Vespers shows an elegantly dressed noblewoman emerging from her castle, reaching into her purse, and placing a coin into a beggar’s bowl (Fig. 9). The scroll above the figures quotes Luke 11:41, “Give alms, and all things are clean unto you.” Although not explicitly identified as

⁵⁶ Paul Binsky, Medieval Death: Ritual and Representation (New York: Cornell University Press, 1996): 29. Binksy presents the Medieval belief that by living and dying in a state of grace, one could build up a “credit system” that would shorten their time in Purgatory.
Catherine, the woman’s dress, a red silk velvet mantle, lined with ermine, resembles that worn by the duchess folio 1v. The women’s identical hairstyles and white headdresses provide further evidence that Catherine is the woman aiding the poor. By placing the duchess in the image, the artist once again enlists her as a character within the manuscript, physically interacting with the other figures. Here, Catherine is instructed how to behave on earth and is shown that performing good deeds on earth will both lessen her loved one’s time in Purgatory and cleanse her own soul.

As Purgatorial time is tailored to fit each individual, the images presented to Catherine would have been both informative and deeply intimate. They present her with corporeal visions of these usually imprecise locations, and instruct her exactly how to lessen or avoid her own time and that of her loved ones in Purgatory. A more symbolic image in the Monday Hours pictures the tortured Souls Tormented in Purgatory (fig. 8). Although Satan’s mouth is often associated with Hell in both art and literature, the Master of Cleves has located seven souls in Purgatory within the mouth of a monstrous and flaming beast, whose eyes and ears both seem to emit the fire. Beneath the ominous fangs, these souls take corporeal form, each engaged in a unique physical act. To the far left a woman raises her arms in what seems to be an act of either prayer or pain, three souls kneel in prayer, and another stands with his hands clasped, looking off into the unknown distance with possible hope. One soul seems to be fainting within the flames, as another holds the figure in order to keep it from falling. The various hands raised in the air, clasped in prayer, brought to one’s head, and pulling on another body demonstrate the liveliness and physical presence of the souls within Purgatory. Catherine would have seen these souls as active, mobile, and suffering beings in pain. Any viewer would also see them as vibrantly illustrating Jacques Le Goff’s comment that, “gestures of Purgatory are merely the gestures of man on earth writ large.”

---

and immobile figures; rather, they respond to the physical conditions surrounding them, demonstrating that the body and soul are connected. By picturing the soul itself in a tangible and anthropomorphic form, we are shown the corporeality of punishment in Purgatory. Their mouths, which may be open in prayer, song, or even screams of pain, create an even more realistic image. Although Catherine could not physically hear the sounds of each figure, the Master of Cleves presents the illusion of sound and allows Catherine to imagine the wails of pain and prayer. By calling upon the viewer’s imagination and appealing to one’s sense of hearing, the figures become more animated and present. Through emphasizing dynamic physical positions, expressions of pain, and alluding to sound, the Master of Cleves could generate strong visceral responses to the images in Purgatory that relay how salvation involves the rescue of both the body and the soul.

The following four images within the Monday Hours of the Dead consist of the contemporary death and funeral practices that chronologically follow the Deathbed Scene. After the man has died and his soul has entered Purgatory, his body still exists on earth, as seen in the Preparation of the Corpse (Fig. 10). Two men lower the corpse onto a bed of straw upon the floor to absorb any bodily fluids. His pale and fragile complexion, bent arms, protruding ribcage, open eyes and mouth, and curled toes are truthful to a corpse. Although the man’s soul no longer resides within his body, contemporary theology believed that one’s body would be restored on the day of the Last Judgment. Therefore, one’s body must not be forgotten about after death. During the fifteenth century, much emphasis was placed on the death and burial rituals that preserved these

58 Le Goff, The Birth of Purgatory, 83. Here, Le Goff describes the body as an a “slave’s prison for the soul.” See chapter “Body and Ideology in the Medieval West.”
59 Unlike most other images from books of hours that detail the preparation of the corpse, such as the Last Rites by the Chief Associate of Maître François (Hours for Paris use. France, Paris, c. 1485-90, MS M.231, fol 137r), where the patron was only shown the sewing of the man’s corpse into a shroud, the Master of Cleves shows Catherine the entire nude and decaying body of the deceased.
beliefs associated with the body and soul’s transition from the earthly world to the next.

The Monday Hours of Catherine’s manuscript records the following funerary ceremony and death rituals in progress for the viewer, making the process more concrete in Catherine’s mind. The events begin with the Chanting of the Office of the Dead (Fig. 11), lead by three singing clerics and accompanied by mourners dressed in black. The clerics follow their book with open mouths and gesturing hands that are so realistic one can imagine the sounds of their chants. The mourners behind the coffin reappear in following scene during the Burial (Fig. 12). The priest offers a final blessing and sprinkles holy water from an aspergillum onto the wooden coffin as it is lowered into the ground. The majority of people during the Middle Ages were not buried in coffins and were only protected by a shroud, as seen in the Burial Scene from MS 453, f. 133v at the Pierpont Morgan Library (Fig. 13). Wealthy citizens and royalty, however, were often buried in wooden coffins, or less commonly in stone sarcophagi. It was customary in the case of royal deaths for an effigy of the deceased to be placed on the coffin as well. 61 Although this particular wooden coffin does not contain a representation of the deceased, Catherine would have expected a similar burial ceremony. By visibly introducing Catherine to contemporary funerary expectations with such detail, the Master of Cleves creates a realistic scenario with which the viewer could relate in order to prepare for the death of a loved one.

While the body has been placed in the coffin, the deceased’s soul still resides in Purgatory, as illustrated by the following illuminations in the Monday Hours. The three illustrations following the Burial form a sequence that further instructs Catherine how to assist her loved ones in Purgatory. In Offering at a Requiem Mass (Fig. 15), the priest faces the altar praying. At his side kneels a man in black, accompanied by two additional mourners. As a kneeling mourner offers a

vessel to an attendant, the attendant places a gift of bread atop the altar. The Vespers image immediately following this scene is that of the *Souls in Purgatory Consoled with the Offering* (Fig. 16) in which an angel descends into the fires of Purgatory to present the bread to the suffering souls kneeling in prayer. The following image, the *Release of the Souls from Purgatory* (Fig. 17), completes this narrative. As the burning souls are led out of the fiery mouth, the message becomes clear to the viewer: through worldly actions, Catherine can impact the afterlives of her loved ones. In relation to the image of Catherine giving alms to the poor, the illuminations visually instruct Catherine, showing her the positive results of the deed. By examining this sequence of images and later seeing herself performing good works in the Tuesday Hours, Catherine would be able to understand and visualize the cause and effect relationship between devotion, charity, and salvation.

The series of Purgatorial images concludes with a scene of the *Last Judgment* (Fig. 18), the first illustration of the Penitential Psalms. Trumpeting angels call the dead, who emerge as naked figures—resembling those in Purgatory—from their graves. Christ, who displays his dripping wounds, is seated upon the arc of Heaven. The fiery angels, pleading figures, a bleeding Christ, the rocky entrance to Hell in the center of the composition, and the lurking red demon work together to create an intense and menacingly visceral reminder of one’s fate if not prepared for the moment of the Last Judgment. One of the most comforting aspects of the image, however, is Mary, who serves as an intercessor alongside John the Baptist. Once again, the Virgin bears her breast to Christ on behalf of the dead. Mary continues to serve as a model for Catherine and a means of uniting the two worlds throughout their shared physical sense of maternal authority. As a reassuring presence and intercessor in religious manuscripts, Mary is the figure particularly implored at the moment of death, and here at the moment of the Last Judgment serves as a mother for one’s final moments.
before death. As in *The Virgin and the Crucified Christ Intercede for Catherine of Cleves*, she reminds Christ that she is his mother by emphasizing the physical nature of her female body. It would be in this crucial moment of the Final Judgment that Catherine would receive her body back after death. The images of death rituals, funerary ceremonies, and the representations of Purgatory within the Tuesday Hours of the Dead provided Catherine with a visual preview of her life after death. This visual journey, while informative, may have left Catherine both prepared and unsettled. Already having established a physical connection to Mary, however, the Virgin’s presence here and the emphasis on her breast could have reassured Catherine that the bodies and souls of her and her loved ones would be saved during the Last Judgment.

Through encapsulating realistic ceremonies and rituals, as well as the pain and suffering awaiting every worldly sinner in the afterlife, the Monday Hours provide Catherine with a visual preview of her own future and that of her loved ones. Being able to see the decomposing flesh of the deceased, imaginatively hear the chanting voices of the clerics, and feel the burning fires of purgatory would instruct Catherine on the actions she must take on earth to save the souls of her loved ones in purgatory. These corporeal images allow Catherine’s mind and body to comprehend the lessons of piety, respect for the dying, and the importance of good works on earth. The realistic and tangible nature of the illuminations will continue to prompt sensory responses from the viewer, even outside of the central miniatures.

---

While studying the pages of most prayerbooks, our eyes are initially drawn to the miniature narratives and secondly to the surrounding border decorations placed outside the central illumination and text; yet, this is not the case in The Hours of Catherine of Cleves. Although many perceive the miniatures as most important, considering the surrounding borders as an intermediary link between the central narrative and the viewer’s physical world, suggests the significant meaning of the “lesser” details within the manuscript. Anne Rudloff Stanton has looked closely at marginal narratives existing in Gothic prayer books, noting how manuscripts illuminated in England and France in the late thirteenth and fourteenth centuries often contain scenes providing a visual focus aside from the prayers themselves. She argued that visual narrative might have interested the lay patrons more than the prayers themselves, encouraging them to turn each page. For medieval viewers, visual contact with images would have provided spiritual benefits that did not depend on reading and decoding the text. Examining details from the Weekday Hours, as well as the unique borders surrounding the Suffrages of the Saints miniatures, will demonstrate how particular details continue Catherine’s seemingly sensory and tactile connection with the supra-worldly, ultimately heightening her emotional and physical engagement with her prayerbook.

Images and figures that extend beyond their borders further break down the boundaries

---

63 Anne Rudloff Stanton, “Turning the Pages: Marginal Narratives and Devotional Practice in Gothic Prayerbooks, in Push Me, Pull You: Physical and Spatial Interaction in Late Medieval and Renaissance Art vol. 2 (Leiden; Boston: Brill, 2011), 76. She argues that those studying and contemplating Psalters in particular, as non-narrative texts, may have benefitted from marginal narrative sequences. In her essay, Stanton closely examines the Isabella Psalter, the Tikhill Psalter, the Queen Mary Psalter, and the Taymouth Hours.
between Catherine’s realm and the divine realm, continuing what began with the overlapping frames in *Catherine of Cleves Kneeling before the Virgin*. Figures and objects in the Passion miniatures, such as *The Flagellation of Christ* (Fig. 19) and *Christ Carrying the Cross* (Fig. 20) overlap each of their respective margins. The hands and feet of Christ’s tormentors, as well as the base of the cross extend over the miniature frames, linking the subjects of these miniatures with the borders and to Catherine herself.\(^6\) Two other images, *Christ Standing on the Lowered Cross* from the Mass of the Cross (Fig. 21) and *Virgin Kneeling Before Christ* (Fig. 22) illustrate Christ’s cross projecting over the border. In the latter image, Christ and the Virgin’s double throne breaks through the surrounding border as well. By illustrating objects that are in contact with holy figures passing through their own space and into Catherine’s, the Master of Catherine of Cleves further bridges the separation between the two worlds, emphasizing the presence of sacred figures in Catherine’s life.

The decorative scheme and borders are, however, what most distinguishes the *Hours of Catherine of Cleves* from contemporary books of hours. Many of the borders surrounding the Cleves miniatures follow a standard format, consisting of running lines of painted flowers, stylized vines (*rinceaux*) revealing golden pods and leaves, and curved multi-colored acanthus leaves in the corners, as seen surrounding the *Virgin Kneeling Before Christ*. Due to the high demand for devotional books at the time, production processes aimed for efficiency, often relying on the use of repetitive motifs.\(^6\) This type of standard border is used extensively in the folios from the *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*.

---

\(^6\) Marrow, “*Multitudo et Varietas*,” 30. Marrow elaborates on the significance of this concept by referencing the Hours of Margaret of Cleves once more. He writes that subjects overlap the frames, “as if entering into her spatial and devotional sphere. This emphasizes the notion that Margaret’s faithful devotion can make sacred figures and events be emphatically present to her.” (29-30). Just as in the Hours of Margaret of Cleves, figures overlap the borders in Catherine’s Book of Hours as well, allowing similar conclusions to be drawn.

the Virgin through the Hours of the Compassion, with borders of naturalistic plants and exotic acanthus leaves occasionally supplementing the general pattern. Many of the borders in Catherine’s manuscript are strictly ornamental, with no apparent direct thematic or iconographic link to the text or miniature they surround. Although these decorations display the illuminator’s artistic virtue, varying border designs reveal a greater function of the manuscript.

Many marginal decorations within Catherine’s manuscript, particularly those in the Suffrages, contain remarkable representations of real objects and secular motifs. Plummer suggests that the increasing elaboration of the borders may indicate a progression of artistic style and ability, yet they also reveal the artistic aim to link the manuscript to the personal interest of the duchess.66

The Suffrages of the Saints are illustrated with an uncommonly large number of half-page miniatures portraying the saints or their martyrdoms, and life-size flowers, jewels, feathers, baked goods, animals, rosary beads, and further contemporary objects surround many of images.67 A number of the decorations directly reference the Duchess or display items she is known to have owned, underscoring the Master of Cleves’ innovative iconographic program in the margins as a means for personalizing the book in a tactile manner. These detailed images would have given the Duchess a unique experience of discovering new scenes during her meditations.68 Furthermore, these commonplace images surrounding holy figures and scenes provided Catherine with yet another means of grasping the sacred realm from within her home.

66 Plummer, The Hours of Catherine of Cleves, 16-17
67 There were originally sixty-one miniatures within the Suffrages, only fifty-seven survive today. Plummer, 1966; Gorissen, 1973: pp. 38-39: fols 330 (St. Quirinus), 346, 357 (St. Margaret), and 363 are missing. Bas-de-page narratives also accompany certain Saints, meticulously illustrating events from their lives. Below Saint Benedict, an illustration shows Benedict’s drowning disciple, Saint Placidus, who is rescued by Saint Maurus after Benedict instructs him to miraculously walk on water. Beneath the half-page miniature of Saint Alexis, the artist has included an image of the saint lying dead upon a bed beneath a set of stairs. As the legend goes, Saint Alexis lived unrecognized under his parent’s stairs after making a pilgrimage to the Holy Land and giving up his wealth.
68 Marrow, “Multitudo et Varietas, 31.
Efforts have been made to understand and explain the logic meaning behind the juxtapositions of marginal decorations with the illustrations they accompany, however, a more straightforward reading may provide insight as well. In addition to Mary Carruthers’ suggestion that the marginal designs function to make each page distinctly memorable, the decorations could be understood as engaging images that Catherine might see in her daily life.\(^69\) For example, twenty-five carefully detailed gold and silver coins depicting contemporary currency surround the miniature of *Saint Gregory the Great* (Fig. 23). Although the money relates to the iconography of Saint Gregory, one of the administrators of the church, the coins may serve the more obvious purpose of creating a direct connection to Catherine and her own life.\(^70\) The detail is so great that most coins can be identified, suggesting the availability of real coins for the artist to copy. The Master of Cleves has chosen specific coins with Catherine in mind, including currency with inscriptions related to her family. At least two coins read “DUX: ARNOLD’: GLE,” presumably in reference to Catherine’s husband, Arnold.\(^71\) Although Catherine and Arnold were in a heated political battle in the 1440s, this detail demonstrates the effort of the artist to incorporate Catherine and her family into the illustrations during production. This currency would have also been common in daily use in fifteenth-century Netherlands, and the inclusion of these contemporary and


\(^{70}\) König, “Ms. M. 917, p. 240, *St Gregory the Great, head miniature for the suffrage,*” in *The Hours of Catherine of Cleves: Devotion, Demons and Daily Life in the Fifteenth Century*, 372. Gorissen also explains the coins through the money legend according to which the young Gregory has founded an abbey with inherited riches (see F. Gorissen, *Das Stundenbuch der Katharina von Kleve. Analyze und Kommentar*, Berlin 1973).

\(^{71}\) Gorissen, *Das Stundenbuch der Katharina von Kleve*, 649-99. Gorissen has identified foreign currency among the coins, yet claims that most are attributed to Utrecht, Holland, Guelders and Cleves. Among the coins are the Utrecht Guilders, minted from 1432 onwards; guilders from Guelders or Arnhem from the period of Reginald IV duke of Guelders; and Dutch pennies as minted for Count Wilhelm IV (1404-1417). See also Pol, “Objects depicted in the miniatures and margins of the Hours of Catherine of Cleves,” in *The Hours of Catherine of Cleves: Devotion, Demons and Daily Life in the Fifteenth Century*, 141. Pol says that old coins were never withdrawn from circulation, and that most of the coins pictures here would have been common in daily use in the mid-fifteenth century Netherlands.
personalized coins allowed Catherine to, once again, connect aspects of her daily life to a holy figure and engage with the image in a new way. Catherine likely held coins such as these, and the detail with which the artist has rendered the coins makes them seemingly tactile. The visible signs of wear on many of the coins that blurs certain details suggests the physical handling of the coins. Catherine could understand them as having been touched, rubbed, and exchanged between hands; their physical traces of use are made more real.

The Master of Cleves has painted another object surrounding the Adoration of the Magi (Fig. 24) that was likely owned and handled by Catherine herself: a personalized rosary. This scene that rarely appears in Suffrages interrupts the series of portraits, yet its border serves a unique purpose and directly invoke participation from Catherine’s own physical body. The coral beads of the paternoster cord are finished with detailed pearls on each end, golden tassels, and are decorated with a golden cross at the center and a seven-pointed star. A small pouch bearing the letters “CD” is attached to the valuable beads and is accepted as the initials for Catherina Duxissa. The pouch itself is intricately detailed, and the artist has delicately painted the drawstrings, golden mouth, and the red tassels drawn through the pearls. The presence of Catherine’s rosary creates a remarkable associative relationship with this scene. Just as the Magi adore the Virgin and Child, so does

---


73 Although it is unknown whether this exact rosary belonged to Catherine, many royal inventories mention red coral rosaries, and this particular rosary is regarded as the best known illustration of a late medieval string of coral, according to Koldeweij. See Koldeweij, “Objects depicted in the miniatures and margins of the Hours of Catherine of Cleves,” in The Hours of Catherine of Cleves: Devotions, Demons and Daily Life in the Fifteenth Century, 150.

74 Plummer, The Hours of Catherine of Cleves, catalogue 116. Plummer highlights the odd placement of the Adoration of the Magi between the hagiological portraits and notes that it precedes the suffrage for the Three Kings.

Catherine, using her rosary as a guide. Furthermore, as the standing king points to the star that guided them, our eyes are guided toward the star of Catherine’s physical rosary. Not only does this create a direct connection between the scene and its border, but also the illustration is possibly even guiding her to use her rosary during meditation.

The use of prayer beads for keeping track of repetitions of prayers has a long history. As an object of tactile comfort, rosaries were used as a means of counting prayers, as seen in William of Malmesbury’s statement about Lady Godiva of Voventry, who bequeathed to the convent she founded “a circlet of gems which she had threaded on a string in order that by fingering them one by one as she successively recited her prayers she might not fall short of the exact number.” While using the rosary and after making the sign of the cross, the devotee generally begins to recite the Pater Notre followed by ten Ave Marias and a Gloria. The name “Our Lady’s Psalter” was given to this devotion from an early period, as the Aves correspond to the number of the Psalms. The Virgin Mary was also given the title “Our Lady of the Rosary” in relation to the Rosary. Although we do not know the exact nature of Catherine’s personal rosary, these prayers sometimes triggered olfactory responses, as women often owned rosaries made of perfumed beads. While using her rosary and reciting numerous Hail Mary’s, Catherine could connect the corporeal act of running the beads between her fingers to her relationship with the Virgin Mary. As seen in the Master of the View of St. Gudule’s Virgin and Child with Donor (Fig. 25), in which the donor and her vision of

76 Koldeweij, “Objects depicted in the miniatures and margins of the Hours of Catherine of Cleves,” 150.
77 Richard Gribble, The History and Devotion of the Rosary (Indiana: Our Sunday Visitor, Inc., 1992), 17. The earliest reference to prayer counting in the Catholic faith is connected to the hermit, Paul of Egypt, who in the 4th century would collect 300 stones and throw one each time he recited one of the 300 prayers he repeated that day.
78 Gribble, The History and Devotion of the Rosary, 20.
Christ both physically interact with her prayer beads, the act of praying with a rosary could be associated to a physical connection to the divine. Along with these sensory and tactile associations with rosaries, coral was also believed to have magical powers of protection against evil and for increasing fertility.81 This meaning would have been particularly significant to Catherine, as two of Catherine’s male sons died at a young age.82 Once again, we see a connection between the Virgin Mary and motherhood, this time embodied by an item Catherine would have held in her hand during prayer.

Along with the physical sensation of touch, many border decorations and bas-de-page illuminations could also trigger Catherine’s senses of smell and taste. Contemporary beliefs on the importance of smell—from the unpleasant stench of hell to the sweet scents of heaven—was based on the perception that Christians who lived in a state of grace would be infused with the divine scent of the Holy Spirit, or the breath of God.83 The various images referencing certain smells and tastes in association with divine figures may inspire such ideas among contemporary viewers. In *Solomon Orders the Tree Cut Down* (Fig. 26) from the Friday Hours of the Compassion, the bas-de-page is adorned with a man grilling two chickens on an open-air spit. As the flames rise from behind, a dripping pan has been placed beneath the animals. If closely examining this image, Catherine could imagine the smells emanating from the roasting meat and dripping juices. This theme of baking continues in the bas-de-page of *St. Philip* in the Suffrages (Fig. 27). Here, the Master of Cleves has painted three figures baking bread. While the woman on the left measures

82 Catherine’s children were most likely born within the first ten years of her marriage. Her first daughter was born in 1433, and her first son, William, was born in 1434, yet died shortly after. Edward, her second son born in 1435, also died a young death. It was not until 1439 that Adolph, Catherine’s only surviving son, was born. As producing a male heir would have been a priority for the Duchess, her fertility was vital.
ingredients, one man kneads the dough as the other pushes the rounded pieces into a stone oven. Again, red flames rise from the food, along with thin, wispy white flames that may even allude to the aroma emanating from the warm dough. Although the scene relates to St. Philip, the patron saint of pastry chefs, the image demonstrates secular baking practices, and Catherine could have imagined inhaling the savory smells of the cooking food during her meditation. Edibles are also illustrated in the borders of *Saint Bartholomew* (Fig. 28) and *Saint Ambrose* (Fig. 29). Interlaced pretzels and crackers surround St. Bartholomew, and while they are not physically baking, their edible nature may trigger a sensory response from the viewer. The mussels and crab pictured in the border of *St. Ambrose* could create a similar response. The edible crab, which is known in the Netherlands as the North Sea crab, is not part of the saint’s iconography, but could present a desirable meal for the viewer. Furthermore, the eleven muscles open themselves up to the viewer, almost inviting Catherine to scoop the meat from the shell.

As most of these cuisines have little or no relation to the saints, they reference Catherine’s secular world and could trigger further sensory reactions of the viewer who could imagine smelling or tasting each food. In addition, prior to the Post-Enlightenment era, smell was taken very seriously in the west, and the “odor of sanctity” was often associated with the saints. In medieval Europe, scents were also commonly thought of have a potent effect on the spirit and were believed to have

---

84 S. Stowell, “Reading the Margins in the Hours of Catherine of Cleves, *Word and Image* 24 (2008): 378-92. Stowell connects this image to eucharistic practice, arguing that one’s imagination suffices to turn the crackers into a Host. In this case, Catherine could imagine consummig the edibles as she did during Holy Communion.  
85 *Cancer pagurus* is known in the Netherlands as the North Sea crab.  
86 Constance Classen, “The Breath of God,” 376. The “odor of sanctity,” is said to occur on or after the death of a saint. Classen notes that it was said of the eight-century St. Hubert of Brittany that “When [St. Hubert] breathed his last, there spread throughout Brittany an odor so sweet, that it seemed as if God had brought together all the flowers of spring to symbolize the heavenly sweetness which Hubert would enjoy in Paradise.”
the ability to induce repentance and offer spiritual consolation. If smell was considered a mode of interaction between the soul and the divine, and the scents of heaven were specifically associated with the saints, the inclusion of various cuisines, roasting meat, and baked bread could trigger strong religious responses within Catherine. These imagined scents could, in fact, serve as the blessed odors of the saints illustrated on each page. Through imaginative inhalation of these sweet scents, Catherine could develop a somatic spiritual connection with the divine figures.

Particular border imagery referencing pilgrimage continues to create a visual and interactive narrative for Catherine to follow throughout her manuscript. Pilgrimage had been a fundamental institution of European society well before the fifteenth century. Although the roads to the Holy Land, Santiago de Compostela, and Rome remained active with travelers, pilgrimage often appeared in the Middle Ages as a symbolic metaphor for life, and was often incorporated into works of art. The devout woman praying for her loved one in the Deathbed miniature appears again, traveling through multiple bas-de-pages scenes within the book. She appears underneath the miniature of a Guardian Angel and Demon Fighting over the Book of Life (Fig. 30), clasping her hands in prayer. Later within the suffrages, in the border of Saint James (Fig. 31), the woman recurs again in the guise of a pilgrim, and is now being weeping in the arms of another figure, presumably a cleric. Kneeling on the ground, the woman seems to be giving the cleric money. She occurs once more beneath Saint Thomas Apostle (Fig. 32), now traveling with packs strapped over her shoulders, carrying a walking stick. Plummer suggests that the grieving widow is preparing to leave on a pilgrimage to Santiago de Compostela. This particular episodic sequence of images that follow the widow creates an ancillary narrative that encourages the reader to keep turning each page. Episodic

87 Classen, “The Breath of God,” 381.
89 Plummer, The Hours of Catherine of Cleves, catalogue [M-p.216]
90 Plummer, The Hours of Catherine of Cleves, catalogue 109. M221.
narratives such as this are particularly suited to manuscripts, because unlike panel painting, the images are viewed separately through time as the reader turns each page.91

Throughout the Middle Ages, theologians valued painted images for their ability to engage the base corporeal senses and stimulate otherworldly modes of vision. Thus, they believed that praying before a devotional image was similar to taking a pilgrimage to a sacred shrine.92 Devotional handbooks directing readers on imaginary pilgrimages were also common in the fifteenth century, and explained how one could benefit from within their own home.93 Spiritual or mental pilgrimage was believed to be effective enough for the worshipper to earn indulgences as if they had taken the physical journey themselves. Therefore, by mentally tracing the pilgrim’s progression throughout the manuscript and meditating upon images depicting the events in the Savior’s life, Catherine could experience her own form of mental pilgrimage in a seemingly physical sense.

Lastly, the miniature of Saint Nicholas (Fig. 33) contains what is arguably the most unique border, one creating an incredibly intense corporeal relationship between the image and Catherine’s own hands, which held the manuscript. With this image, rather than focusing on the additional marginal decorations, it is important to focus on exactly how the page is painted. As the three monsters at each corner of the border gnaw on golden orbs, the page itself is opened up, or rather, is peeled back to reveal Saint Nicholas and the surrounding starlit sky.94 Here, the manuscript leaf is

93 Botvinik, “The Painting as Pilgrimage,” 8. An early example of a Franciscan manuscript from St-Trond assures the reader that by reciting the paternoster ten times a day and by distributing alms equal to the offering he would have made in Rome at his local church, he would earn all of the indulgences of the Holy Land from within his home.
treated as an element of the imagery itself, and guides the reader into Saint Nicholas’ divine realm. With this trompe l’oeil method, the Master of Catherine of Cleves altered the design of traditional illustrations to create a new form of access to the divine.\textsuperscript{95} Catherine could imagine pulling or clawing at the vellum in order to reveal the scene underneath. Through illusion, the illuminator has made it necessary to study the page and decipher the paint from the actual vellum, therefore insisting on the physical connection between Catherine’s outer world and the saintly world within the illumination. Her devotional book of hours symbolically and now seemingly physically breaks through the boundary between the sacred sphere and Catherine’s own hands.

Although the opening miniature of \textit{The Book of Hours of Catherine of Cleves} reflects the primary purpose of most books of private devotion—to create a connection between the earthly donor and the blessed figures—the marginal decorations serve to further diminish the separation between Catherine and the sacred. By triggering mental, physical, olfactory and gustatory associations and responses from the viewer, the detailed border decorations provide for Catherine a unique relationship with her book of hours. Being able to imaginatively touch, inhale, or taste the food, scents, and objects illustrated for her private examination elevated Catherine to a privileged position, creating a personal and tactile bond to the spiritual world.

\textsuperscript{95} Marrow, \textit{Multitudo et Varietas},” 24.
CONCLUSION

Throughout history, and continuing throughout the Middle Ages, men were associated with terms such as self-control, order, rationality, intellect, activity, and reason, while women were usually joined with the “inferior” terms of disorder, irrationality, body, sensation, and emotion. By appealing to Catherine’s female sensory responses, however, the illustrations take advantage of a woman’s body, sensations, and emotions to create a deeper spiritual experience for the viewer. It is through creating this harmony between physical body and spiritual soul that one gains a sense of instruction, action, and reason in relation to the divine realm. Not only did owning a book of hours such as this provide Catherine with more spiritual initiative and freedom outside of the church structure, it also supplied her with a unique and powerful connection to the divine realm. The individualization and private nature of the manuscript allowed Catherine to establish a multisensory connection to her book and the images inside. By visually placing Catherine within particular illustrations, among the Virgin Mary, Christ, and God the Father, the Master of Cleves invoked the direct participation of Catherine’s body and instructed the nature of her prayers. The numerous detailed and corporeal illustrations of death ritual and the body, as well as the inclusion of contemporary items and personal belongings allow Catherine to personally connect to the figures she meditates upon. Catherine is provided a means of access to the Virgin’s body through highly personalized and intimate interactions with the Queen of Heaven; she is able to envision and understand the physical pain and suffering of her loved ones in Purgatory; and finally, she is given the opportunity to imaginatively touch smell and taste objects associated with the divine.

Overall, the Hours of Catherine of Cleves demonstrates that it was not just the numerous hands-on practices of prayer—touching relics, Eucharistic practices, praying with a rosary, or

kissing and touching pieces of religious art—that could create a tangible and sensory association with prayer and the divine. The pages of Catherine’s book of hours allowed her to do this privately and individually through the unique illustrations that call upon her body and emphasize the sacred realm as tactile to Catherine. By engaging Catherine’s body and providing a multi-sensory experience associated with prayer, this *Hours of Catherine of Cleves* demonstrates the unique and powerful experiences books of hours provided for individuals in the intimate setting of their own home, and has left its unique and everlasting touch on our perceptions of illuminated manuscripts.
Figure 1: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, f. 1v, “Catherine of Cleves Praying to the Virgin and Child,” Saturday Hours of the Virgin (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.845).

Figure 2: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, “Holy Family at Work,” Saturday Hours of the Virgin (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.917).
Fig. 3: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, “Holy Family at Supper,” Saturday Hours of the Virgin (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.917).

Fig. 4: Jean Fouquet, *Melun Diptych* (92 x 85 cm; ca. 1450; Antwerp: Museum of Fine Arts).
Figure 5: Campin, *Merode Altarpiece* (ca. 1425-28; New York: The Cloisters, Metropolitan Museum of Art).

Figure 6: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, p. 160, “The Virgin and the Crucified Christ Intercede for Catherine of Cleves,” Saturday Mass of the Virgin (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.917).
Figure 7 Hours of Catherine of Cleves, p. 180, “Deathbed Scene,” Monday Hours of the Dead (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.917).
Figure 8: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, f. 97r, “Souls Tormented in Purgatory,” Monday Hours of the Dead (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library M.945).

Figure 9: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, p. 65, “Catherine of Cleves Distributing Alms,” Tuesday Hours of the Holy Spirit (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.917).
Figure 10: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, f. 99v, “Preparation of the Corpse,” Monday Hours of the Dead (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.945).

Figure 11: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, f. 101r, “Chanting of the Office of the Dead,” Monday Hours of the Dead (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.945).
Figure 12: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, f. 102v, “Burial,” Monday Hours of the Dead (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.945).

Figure 13: The Master of Morgan 453, *Burial Scene*, f. 133v (ca 1425-30; New York: Morgan Library MS M.453).
Figure 15: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, f 104r, “Offering at a Requiem Mass,” Monday Hours of the Dead (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.945).

Figure 16: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, f 105v, “Souls in Purgatory Consoled with the Offering,” Monday Hours of the Dead (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.945).
Figure 17: Hours of Catherine of Cleves, f. 107r, “Release of the Souls from Purgatory,” Monday Hours of the Dead (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.945).
Figure 18: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, p. 28, “Last Judgment,” (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.917).
detail of Mary from the “Last Judgment,” p. 28, MS M.917.

Figure 19: Hours of Catherine of Cleves, f. 60v, “The Flagellation of Christ,” Hours of the Passion (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.945).
Figure 20: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, f. 63v, “Christ Carrying the Cross,” Hours of the Passion (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.945).

Figure 21: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, p. 121, “Christ Standing on the Lowered Cross,” Mass of the Holy Cross (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.917).
Figure 22: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, p. 39, “Virgin Kneeling Before Christ (Christ Receiving the Virgin into Heaven?),” Wednesday Hours of All Saints (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.917).
Figure 23: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, p. 240, “Saint Gregory the Great” with detail, Suffrages (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.917).
Figure 24: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, p. 237, “Adoration of the Magi” with detail, Suffrages (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.917).
Figure 25: Master of the View of SaintGuduel, *Virgin with Child and Donor* (50 x 56 cm; ca. 1470; Musee Diocesain, Liege, Belgium).

Figure 26: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, p. 101, detail from “Solomon Orders the Tree Cut Down,” Friday Hours of the Compassion of God (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.917).
Figure 27: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, p. 226, detail from “Saint Philip,” Suffrages (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.917).

Figure 28: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, p. 228, “Saint Bartholomew,” Suffrages (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.917).
Figure 29: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, p. 224, “Saint Ambrose,” Suffrages (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.917).

Figure 30: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, p. 206, detail from “Guardian Angel and Demon Fighting over the Book of Life,” Suffrages (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.917).
Figure 31: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, p. 216, detail from “Saint James,” Suffrages (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.917).

Figure 32: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, p. 221, detail from “Saint Thomas Apostle,” Suffrages (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.917).
Figure 33: *Hours of Catherine of Cleves*, p. 28, “Saint Nicholas” with detail, Suffrages (192 x 130 mm; ca. 1440; New York: Morgan Library MS M.917).